

# THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

Entered as second-class matter November 18, 1907, at the Post Office, New York, N. Y., under the Act of Congress of March 3, 1879

VOL. III

NEW YORK, JANUARY 8, 1910

No. 11

Under the title *Essays of Poetry and Poets Ancient and Modern*, Vice-Chancellor Warren of Oxford has reprinted a series of valuable essays that have appeared at various times since 1895 in English periodicals. Several of these essays are of interest to us, particularly those on Sophocles and the Greek Genius, The Art of Translation, Vergil and Tennyson, and Ancient and Modern Classics as Instruments of Education.

The essay on The Art of Translation appeared in The Quarterly Review in 1895. Since that time Cauer's *Die Kunst des Übersetzens* and Tolman's *Art of Translating* have appeared, both of which books aim to give practical suggestions to would-be translators. This article of Chancellor Warren, however, discusses the matter in a very broad way, more from the point of view of literary criticism than that of practical suggestion. Much that he says is old, being drawn from other critics, such as Dryden, Matthew Arnold, etc., but he has put the material together in a very interesting fashion and the article is illuminating for those who have heard translations so often either extravagantly praised or extravagantly vilified. For us who have to deal with practical translation in the school-room his concluding paragraphs will be of great comfort.

But translation has had another very important influence, one never perhaps more important than at the present, one still likely to increase—namely in education. That translation is one of the best, perhaps the best, of literary exercises, whether it comes as the self-imposed discipline of the young writer or the set task of the school-boy, is beyond a doubt. In the teaching of the Classics, as they are called, in this country, nothing has been more striking than the growth in importance of written translation. Whereas original composition, in Latin especially, the original copy of verse or the Latin essay—"Latin writing", as it was significantly called—was at the beginning of the century the prevailing exercise and translation the exception, now the latter is the rule, the former a mere survival. "Translation is the death of understanding". That may be true for the last stage and for the finished scholar; but that translation is the beginning, the quickening of understanding, is the universal belief on which the modern system of education is based. In Germany the revised Prussian code gave it a larger place than before. Both in Germany and among ourselves it has been recognised that real translation, literary translation, not mere literal word-for-word construing, is what is truly educational. At the present moment, as applied to Latin and Greek, it seems to have reached

the highest possible pitch, and there can be little doubt that it is the secret of the efficiency as an educational method of the so-called classical training. One of the reasons why the same mental training is not attained through the modern languages is that the difficulty of translation from them is necessarily less; the other, that the experiment has never been tried in the same way. If the same effect or anything like what has been attained through Latin and Greek is to be attained through French and German, the present system of translation must be greatly expanded. It is not enough to make the student translate ordinary colourless exercises or letters commercial or otherwise in English into the same in French or German. He must be made to distinguish, to appreciate, and to copy the various styles, generic and individual—the style of the orator, the historian, the philosopher, the poet, of Bossuet, or Vergniaud, of Buffon or Béranger, of Goethe or Heine, of Kant or Von Ranke, of Machiavelli or Leopardi.

Then, and only then, will the student trained in modern languages learn the gamut of these languages and his own.  
G. L.

Omnibus et singulis ad quos praesentes hae litterae pervenerint editores COMMENTARII HEBDOMADALIS CLASSICI salutem plurimam dicunt. Lectoribus lucubratiuncularum nostrarum, Gelliano ut verbo utamur, ferias speramus quae modo ob Christum natum actae sunt gaudiis laetitiisque et multis et variis repletas differtasque esse precamurque ut novus annus in quem tam nuper iniimus eis omnibus ad unum unamque bonus, felix, fortunatus faustusque sit. Tota mente viribusque semper enisum ut quae in commentariis nostris essent impressa ea omnia lectoribus nostris re vera auxilio essent rebusque classicis vel Graecis vel Latinis opitulerentur; in futurum autem promittimus atque in nos recipimus etiam maiore studio nos conaturos esse ut singulos in annos Commentarii nostri meliores sint. Lectores oramus obsecramusque ut quantum possint ipsi vicissim nobis auxilio sint rebus dignis scribendis ad nosque mittendis quae iterum iterumque legantur, immo vero *καταρα δὲ δὲ* sint. C. K.

The Executive Committee of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States has accepted with great pleasure the cordial invitation of the Heads of Departments of Greek and Latin of the College of the City of New York, warmly seconded by the President of the College, to hold its fourth annual meeting at that College. The dates fixed are Friday and Saturday, April 22-23 next.

### THE PLACE OF THE READER IN SECOND YEAR LATIN<sup>1</sup>

A Reader in Beginning Latin can be of value only if it increases interest in the language as a living thing, serves as a kind of laboratory exercise on forms and syntax learned in the beginning book, and helps the student in the difficult art of learning to read. Latin, despite our modern efforts to make it alive, is still indisputably a dead language, and often figures before the student's eye as a difficult picture puzzle involving time and toil but yielding no beauty in itself and slight reward save to a sense of pleased and flattered ingenuity. Our method of teaching it in detached and variously shaped fragments adds somewhat to this effect; in the first year's work disastrous weariness sometimes results from a succession of monotonous disconnected sentences tagged with the case and mood they advertise. For the first half year the novelty of the strange language, the victory over inflectional endings, the joy of recognizing English derivatives will hold the student's attention, but, after that, teachers most fertile in resources often find that the interest flags, and that even if there is no moaning over the unending uses of the ablative, minds grow restless and inquire what Latin is for anyway, and whether it is concerned only with wars and javelins and camps. To be able at this stage to produce the laboratory manual, to show *ad hoc litus* when something other than the colorless ship reaches the shore, and a *magnum flumen* that has some interest outside of the gender of the adjective seems to restore the student's confidence in the language. In fact language conforms once more to the dictionary definition, 'the expression of ideas'; the agreements and tenses appear in places where they seem at home even though unaccompanied by red ink guide lines. The quandary of the boy in his first few days of Latin who remarked, "The cases I can understand. The accusative comes in handy, but what is the use of the second conjugation", begins to disappear.

To arouse such interest the subject-matter should have some inherent value. Intelligent boys of eight revolt from *The History of the Robins*, and from similar books written in words of one syllable, because their powers of comprehension far out-rank their ability to read. Very much the same situation confronts the teacher when boys of twelve begin to read Latin. For oral work conversation upon life about them, *Surge, o mi discipule, Hodie discipulos meos non culpabo*, does more good by arousing interest than harm by variation from classic idiom or from Professor Lodge's vocabulary, but these little pleasantries pall on the intelligent boy if continued for half a recitation. It may be very well in England, where boys probably cry out from the cradle in the

classic tongues, to read in Latin about the lunch one's aunt prepared for the picnic, or the cocoanuts that hungry Robinson Crusoe found floating in to the shore, but our pupils who begin Latin at eleven and twelve must be given different pabulum. The occupation of Britain by Caesar seems a subject sufficiently learned, and gives opportunity for many clever imitations of Caesar's style, but tennis balls become strangely mixed with the Roman coins that the boys in *Pro Patria* discover and *Quantopere nos bacae rubrae et nigrae delectaverunt, Nonne prandio satiati eritis? Sed cum me altero pomo recreavero paratus ero* do not exactly recall the Gallic campaigns, while *Nihil habuimus respondere* may for other reasons have a non-Caesarian ring. If we are to defend *Gallinae denariis viginti constant, duodecim ova triginta denariis* it must be for the value of teaching numerals so early, rather than from interest in the price of eggs during the Boer war.

This charge of infantile subject-matter can hardly be made in reference to the curious attempt to revive Joseph Hall's *Mundus Alter et Idem*, written in the year 1600 as a reader for boys about to take up Caesar. Satire is not the form of literature best suited to children of twelve. This is not a boy's book despite the delightful reading we might find in these days of Christian Science and suffragettes in such passages as "If any one among their people become ill, he weeps enough to get well or die. They stubbornly refuse all drugs, only at death allowing themselves to be anointed with oil by their *morosophi*", or again, "You could hardly believe how everything shines there in the houses where, strange as it may seem, only men do the washing, sweeping, and baking. I saw nothing soiled there but the clothing of the men, which certainly was extraordinarily dirty, showing that they neglect themselves, no less than they were neglected by their wives". At best this interesting subject-matter is hardly ideal preparation for reading Caesar. Even in England there is said to be a demand for books that will be a middle ground between puerility and satire, and deal with classical subjects in simple Latin.

Vocabulary is closely allied with subject-matter and would need no separate treatment if we were not convinced of the importance of making our students masters of the words most common in the Latin read in our schools. On this test of vocabulary most of the Readers are found wanting, but wanting in the sense that they abound in words that the Romans of Caesar's day might not have recognized. Concrete illustration is hardly needful to show that the story of Robinson Crusoe cannot be written in the vocabulary of Caesar's Gallic War. *Stega, racemus, surculus, spatha, tudicula, albicare, assare, forfices, cocossae, umbella, and pera* would

<sup>1</sup> This paper was read at the meeting of The Classical Association of the Atlantic States, at Haverford, Pa., April 23, 1909.

hardly be hailed as members of the famous 2000. The *Mundus Alter et Idem*, though less under the constraint of stern necessity than Robinson Crusoe, gives way as might be expected to the imagination, and strange phantoms from unfamiliar worlds glide in and out of the pages. *Incrassare, garriendum, patagiatus, doliolum*, strange compounds and diminutives like *paludinosus* and *pomariolum*, appear along with German and Greek transliterations. This sixteenth century book was the output of a keen fun-loving mind, not the labored book-making of an elementary Latin teacher.

Reference has already been made to the composite character of the vocabulary of *Ora Maritima*, and *Pro Patria*. Two exercises given for translation into Latin and based closely on the text of *Pro Patria* may show some of the faults and virtues in these features of the book.

Our commander-in-chief had sent out a body of horsemen in order that Kimberly might be saved. The inhabitants had endured the siege so long that food was very dear. But they had endured want most bravely in order that the name of Kimberly might be great and famous. On December 10th a British army was only twenty miles away from the town so that the inhabitants were able to see the balloon.

Among the very beautiful Roman villas whose foundations we see at the present day in Britain, was the villa which was situated in the Isle of Wight. This villa has three parts. In the part which looks to the West you see a vestibule, a hall and a dining-room and kitchen. The vestibule and the hall have tessellated pavements. The cubes of the hall are red and white and blue and black.

While the words in some of these English Readers, such as balloons, bags and oysters, are not the most essential for preparation for Caesar, the presence of a few less common words need not condemn a book otherwise excellent. Ritchie's *Fabulae Faciles*, which in Mr. Kirtland's American edition has stood the test of some seven years, is a case in point. *Arca, cubicula, talaria* and *speculum* necessary for the stories of Perseus and Hercules are not perhaps essential for the college examinations, but a comparison of the vocabulary of the first fifteen pages reveals only about 80 words not found in Professor Lodge's 2000. Among these are such obvious words as *centaurus, dormire, oraculum, exclamo, victima, infelix*, several simple compounds of very common verbs and only a few words like *laqueus* and *arca* that are occasioned by the subject-matter itself. Mr. Wyckham, in his commendation of the *Fabulae*, said:

The stories can be told without starting the beginner on the wrong track by a barbarous mixture of ancient and modern ideas. The book combines very skilfully the interest of a continuous story with the gradual and progressive introduction of constructions and idioms. These seem to be introduced at the right moment and to be played upon long enough to make them thoroughly familiar.

Thus we come at length to the real touch-stone of

the matter. Vocabularies may not run so far afield, subject-matter may hold the student's attention, but if the made Latin does not help him apply his knowledge of forms to the expression of ideas, if it does not lead him by gentle stages from the things that he does know to the things that he can know and must learn, if it does not, by giving him familiarity with Latin forms and constructions, supply a momentum that will take him through Caesar more rapidly, the gain from the Reader is not worth the risks involved. When an intelligent boy looking up from his *Fabula* exclaims with excitement, "We have a new kind of subjunctive in to-day's lesson", more than half the battle has been won. That simple statement means that he has a well arranged catalogue of his few subjunctives in his mind, that he is not one of the picture puzzle boys, but uses his reason on a subject that he has come to regard as reasonable, and governed by laws as intelligible and eternal as the laws by which he works out his original propositions in geometry. To accomplish such a result in the pupil's mind the Reader should include only a few definite things which have been gradually introduced and often repeated; it should emphasize all matters of agreement, especially of adjectives, relative pronouns and participles, and should confine itself to the most necessary constructions, the simplest use of the subjunctive of purpose and result, of the accusative and infinitive and the indirect question.

Upon this basis the *Mundus Alter et Idem* must regretfully be dropped from the list of available Readers. As a bit of private reading for an ambitious, enthusiastic boy well through his Caesar, it might prove a diverting task, but in the ordinary course of our American schools there can be no room for it. Although the paragraphs are not complex there is no progress in the syntax.

Many would be glad of a book like Goffeaux's translation of Robinson Crusoe into which we could turn our boys loose and see if they were interested enough to read Latin. The fact that they cared for the story and read ahead would be a good omen for their progress. We should not even be much grieved at their seeing and forgetting strange words like *antlia, ruga*, and *corbis*; they would probably recover even from the effects of such Latin as *inter somnandum, arboris a fulmine disjectae*, but when within the first four pages we find *quippe qui* and the subjunctive, several uses of the gerundive, a condition attracted into the subjunctive, the impersonal *miseret* and several uses of causal clauses, we are reminded that difficulties of periodic structure and vocabulary are not the only stumbling blocks in Latin, and that it is the path of syntax that needs most to be smoothed. Even Mr. Sonnenschein in *Ora Maritima* seems to feel it more dangerous to introduce a second conjugation verb than to give at an early stage



*necesse est*, the ablative absolute, the perfect passive participle and several uses of the gerundive. Simplicity of syntax however and definite progression in difficulty Mr. Sonnenschein has in the main attained. Many chapters moreover are classical in vocabulary, subject-matter and syntax, but some forms and subjects are so long delayed as to hinder progress unnecessarily and even to give the student wrong ideas of the language. The postponement of the second conjugation and the relative pronoun until the Second Reader is open to criticism. We have in consequence such words as *bellabat*, *rebellaverunt*, and *propulsaverunt* and the forms of the perfect of the first conjugation become so fixed in the student's mind that the third conjugation perfect, when finally reached, seems mysterious, and becomes a real difficulty. What may, with due attention to tense signs and personal endings, be taught with advantage for all conjugations in one recitation, becomes a difficulty that weeks of drill can not wholly surmount. Anything so vital as the use of the relative should hardly be delayed until the twentieth page of the Second Reader. Not only may the relative be used with the indicative, but most Latin students need to be impressed with the fact that it often must be. Naught but good could therefore come from its early introduction.

I have lingered over these detailed constructions because it is my conviction that agreement as to the essentials of syntax to be taught in first year Latin is one of the most crying needs of our teaching at present. The effort of ambitious young teachers to have students soon ready for Caesar leads to a cramming with constructions sure to result in intellectual indigestion. The complacency of book-makers in thinking that any construction may appear in a first year book provided that it is explained in parenthesis brings about equal complacency on the part of the student in passing over any construction of case or mood, caring naught as to the reason for it, provided that he can come within a few miles of the meaning; still more, I venture to think, the tyranny of publishers has discouraged even the sanest minded of our writers of elementary books from putting in only what they think essential. As one of our best teachers recently said, "We try to teach in first year composition, what, if we really taught it, would prepare amply for the college examinations in elementary composition".

Of the English Readers, Hall's *Mundus Alter et Idem* and Barnett's *Robinson Crusoe* are lacking in any systematic progress in the difficulties of Latin syntax, and go too far afield in subject-matter to yield a suitable vocabulary. Mr. Sonnenschein's books are weak in vocabulary, childish in subject-matter, and, for schools with only a four year course, sure to detain the pupil too long in his study of forms to insure his reaching the goal in the end.

For American schools the ideal reader may not yet have been written but for the present we can be thankful for anything so good as Mr. Kirtland's edition of Ritchie's *Fabulae Faciles*. Here the syntax is treated with consummate skill, the vocabulary and idioms are closely imitated from Caesar, and the subject-matter, though a little too familiar to students well trained in mythology, is at least classical in tone. The road may perhaps be smoothed a little too much for the bright boy, but the watchful teacher can usually administer enough grammar and prose composition to keep the Latin work from being all holiday.

The length of the Latin course in the well known English schools, the traditions in favor of emphasis on idiom, on memorizing phrases that lend themselves to imitative writing, in lieu of using Latin prose as a help to reading Latin intelligently, precludes any likelihood of their readers exactly fitting our needs. Yet the London Board of Education in a Circular (No. 584, October 10, 1907) issued for teachers of secondary schools, recommends a reader of precisely the character we have been advocating, specifying that the subject-matter be classical, the syntax carefully graduated, but differing in assigning this work to the second of a four years' course, and in including simple narratives in verse.

The large number of Readers suitable for later years of the course now issuing from the English press sets before us anew the problem of substitutes for Caesar, a subject that seemed too large for this discussion. The mere enumeration of the authors represented in these selections, Livy, Tibullus, Propertius, Ovid, Vergil and Horace shows us that there are other ways of teaching Latin than our own. To all these books one element is common, the desire to make the Latin interesting, to try, as one editor says in his preface, to prevent the fate that befalls all too many students "who after construing one or two books of Caesar, leave school with a deep-rooted hatred of the language". For the children in English schools the *Illustrated Reading Book* written by Mr. Healley (Longmans) is evidently designed. Even Vergil and Catullus appear in diluted form and the humorous illustrations would tempt a very dullard. One may however well question the wisdom of teaching *quid mea refert* in the first few months of Latin, the pedagogical effect of *suam ipsam*, translated by 'its mistress', beneath the engaging portrait of Lesbia and the sparrow, or the desirability from a grammatical standpoint of *Hostium clamore territus asino suadebat fugere*.

In Mr. Lowe's *Scenes from the Life of Hannibal* there is definite progress in syntax through the thirty pages and the subject-matter is interesting. The predominance of words peculiar to Livy is perhaps the great weakness of the book.

If we American teachers are once freed from the

tyranny of examinations on large amounts of prepared text, and can have our students tested more on their power to read Latin, we may wish to look at such books as Stone's *Gotham and Other Stories*, and the *New Latin Delectus* by Thomas and Doughty of Hackney Downs School. We may perhaps question the inherent value as literature of translations of Tennyson, Calverly and Hench into Latin verse, and the wisdom of giving forty pages of poetry to twenty of very much simplified Livy, yet there is something suggestive in both books. The twelve pages of prose Latin at the beginning of the *New Delectus* are a good experiment in simplified Latin. The titles, *The Founding of Rome*, *The Battle of Lake Regillus*, *The Kings of Rome*, and the references to the passages in Livy from which they are taken give guarantee as to the interest of their subject-matter, and the character of the Latin and the vocabulary.

To serve as a sign-post warning against Readers that might never be seen is scarcely justification for a paper of this length, to encourage indiscriminate making of many Beginners' Latin Books, of which there is already no end, still less. If, however, one could arouse any discussion as to what was essential and desirable in first year work, encourage any purpose on the part of makers and users of first year manuals to cover less ground and that more thoroughly, to secure by what is read, written and recited a knowledge of forms and elementary syntax that would remain as a permanent possession, if one could help make Latin a study to be desired, because it was interesting, intelligible and stimulating, then it would be time to cry out as we try once more to keep up in the losing race of the classicist, *Nunc nunc insurgite remis, Hecorei socii*.

SUSAN BRALEY FRANKLIN.

ETHICAL CULTURE SCHOOL, New York City.

## REVIEW OF AGAR'S HOMERICA

(Concluded from page 79)

*Homericæ: Emendations and Elucidations of the Odyssey.* By T. L. Agar. Clarendon Press, Oxford (1908). Pp. XI + 436. 14 shillings.

Hiatus licitus is in particular a bête noir to Mr. Agar. He believes, with Pseud.-Plut., quoted in the preface p. x, that τὰ δὲ Ὀμήρου ἔπη τὸ τελευτάτων ἔχει μέτρον, and he labors incessantly to remove this supposed blemish from the text of the poems. So in 1.383 προσέφη must give place to προσέειπ'; in 9.215 εὐ εἰδότες (a thoroughly Homeric phrase) is discarded in favor of εἰδυμένον; in 19.81 γόναι is ousted from the text; and, to cite but one more passage, 6.33 ἐντόνυαι, ἐπεὶ οἱ τοι ἔτι δὴν παρθένος ἔσσαι, after passing through Mr. Agar's hands becomes ἐντόνη' ἐπεὶ οἱ τοι ἔτι δὴν ἔσσαι ἀδμήs.

This process of substituting a different word for

the one found in the text is carried to extremes. προσέειπ' for προσέφη is a mild instance. What shall we say to the following list, selected at random from the very large number of instances offered by Mr. Agar's pages?

4.244 ἱμάσσας for δαμάσσας; 8.262 σέοντο for ἴσταντο; 8.444 φηλήσεται for δηλήσεται; 10.79 ἀάτη for ματίη; 10.415 ἴκοντο for ἔχυντο; 13.379 διομένη for ὀδυρομένη; 24.465 Ἀλιθέσση for Εὐπίθει.

To be sure the Homeric vocabulary is thus enriched by φηλέω 8.444, as by ἐτάζω 18.160, 19.44; but that does not daunt Mr. Agar. He does not hesitate to enrich the Greek language by reading οὐδ' ἀπόριτα for οὐδὲ ποτ' ἴσα in 2.203 (though commenting on Fick's "adventurous novelty, the noun, if it be a noun, ἀποτεῖσα"). So, too, we have a new noun ἐλκή inserted in 18.10; and the ἔγχεδ' ὀξύνοντα of 19.33 becomes δοῦρά τε φοξύνοντα, and we have the note, "Cone-shaped seems to be the meaning, and would be an appropriate description of the metal point of a spear". And the basis for this view is afforded by poor Thersites—who φοξὸς ἔην κεφαλὴν! After reading such passages one has almost to rub one's eyes to be sure that the words on p. 51 really mean what they say, "But as long as the traditional verb can be understood in the sense suggested it has the prior claim".

Mr. Agar's attack upon the 'Attic' article in Homer is vigorous and sustained, though here again his proposed changes exhibit all degrees of likelihood and unlikelihood. It is easy to get rid of "the only passage in the *Odyssey* in which *δεινός* is accommodated or encumbered with the article" (19.535): the mere insertion of δὴ suffices; but of νῆσος (see note on 5.55) we have six instances, and some of these seem inclined to yield less readily to treatment. True occurrence with the article is limited to the accusative singular; but, significant as that fact appears to Mr. Agar, it is not an isolated one. Most elaborate is Mr. Agar's attack upon the article with ξείνος (17.10, 14, pp. 286-291). Here he has no less than thirty-three cases to emend, but he girds himself for the task nothing daunted, and at the end of his discussion reaches the conclusion that "it is idle and futile to treat ὁ ξείνος and τὸν ξείνον as congenital with the *Odyssey*". In the case of μοχλός the article is expunged by what is virtually merely a different division of the letters, so that τάχ' ὁ μοχλός becomes τάχα μοχλός (9.378), just as in 12.165 ἕκαστα λέγων is changed to ἕκαστ' ἀλέγων, and ὁ μολοβρός to ὁμολοβρός in 18.26, with the note, "The traditional and generally accepted explanation, 'glutton', γαστριμαργός, could hardly be better rendered in detail than by a compound containing ὁμός, ὀλος and √βορ".

We come now to the problem of the oblique cases of αὐτός used as a mere pronoun of reference. Mr.

Agar emends between forty and fifty such occurrences, sometimes by substituting the ordinary pronoun, even when this requires the rewriting of the verse (2.128; 11.26; 19.235); sometimes by simply dividing the word (*αὐ τοῖσιν*, 1.143); sometimes by substituting *αὐτως* (as 14.135; 17.367) or *οὕτω* (2.33; 5.190), or some other word, it matters not what one, of the same metrical value (*ἄλλην* 9.153; *ἀντην*, 10.112; *ἀνδρας*, 13.386). Some of these strike one as daring in the extreme; but Mr. Agar will have uniformity at all hazards.

It is but natural that a reviewer should call attention primarily to those features of the book which seem of questionable value, and hence full justice is not done to the author's sound scholarship and remarkable acumen. There are not lacking instances, too, in which it is not acumen and scholarship so much as sound common sense that most impresses one. Reference may be made to the discussion of 9.205 ff., whether or not one accepts Mr. Agar's conclusions; to the amusing illustration of the lack of common sense shown by the Dutch editors in the matter of the rudder (on 5.255); to 13.168 even if the alteration proposed be regarded as unnecessary; and to the frequent and thorough discussions of the meaning of Homeric words. Further, while the views put forth e. g. in the notes on 20.209, 21.402, 24.231, seem quite indefensible, the reviewer finds much to approve of in the interpretations suggested for 4.684; 8.121; 10.112 f.; 11.584; 16.23; 21.26.

Mr. Agar's style is vivacious, but often lacks dignity. It is enlivened by frequent quotations ranging from Horace and Shakespeare to Lewis Carroll, but the writer can hardly free himself from the charge of affectation in passages like the following: "Here the MSS. without exception, so far as I am aware, present *θεσφατο*; but 't would be a topsy-turvy world, my masters, if the combined evidence of eight unquestioned passages were insufficient to overrule a nonsensical unanimity in one" (p. 109); "One instance generally hath a fellow to keep it in countenance" (p. 248).

The book is admirably printed. In addition to the misprints noted in the errata I have observed the following: an omitted accent on *χρηματ'*, p. 25, line 5 from the top; 421 for 422, p. 42, line 16 from bottom; 531 for 530, p. 153, line 8 from bottom; and on the same page two lines further down 505 for 504; 'man' for 'men', p. 159, line 17 from top; 319 for 320, p. 250, line 9 from bottom; 'Eumelus' for 'Eumaeus', p. 304, line 19 from bottom; and a couple of instances of words run together, p. 72, last line but one, and p. 363, line 19 from bottom.

The index to the book, while serviceable, is neither complete nor entirely accurate. A. T. MURRAY.

STANFORD UNIVERSITY, California.

Latin Prose Exercises. By Elizabeth McJ. Tyng. New York: Longmans, Green and Co. (1909).

The chief characteristics of this book are the admirable ones of directness and simplicity; there is a manifest endeavor to avoid the slightest waste of time or energy. The grammatical constructions are introduced in a helpful order; the main points to be noted about each are stated clearly and concisely, and, further, in each lesson there is plenty of drill upon constructions previously studied, so that the student as he advances to conquer new lands still retains his sovereignty over the old. The vocabularies accompanying each lesson are made up of well-chosen words, and the vowel quantities are indicated. Occasionally graphic illustrations are employed to make the topics under consideration more comprehensible to the immature mind. The value of the book may be enhanced by using it in the judicious manner outlined by the author in her preface. Moreover, she states that she has been able to cover the entire manual and read four books of Caesar in a year with recitation periods of only thirty-five minutes in length. Besides a table of contents, an introduction which contains some elementary but not unnecessary admonitions, the book contains a useful summary of constructions, and a catalogue of words governing special constructions. The book contains work for the second year only.

SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY.

HAROLD L. CLEASBY.

High School Course in Latin Composition. By Charles McCoy Baker and Alexander James Inglis. New York: The Macmillan Company (1909). Pp. xiii + 464.

This well-filled book includes all the prose work of the last three years of preparatory Latin. Of its four divisions the first, entitled Elements of Syntax, covers eighty-nine pages, and is practically a brief grammar, or rather the syntactical half of a grammar. The rules are clearly and simply put, and the statement of the more difficult usages is often especially happy. There are many lists of words which are followed by special constructions, and some very helpful tables, e. g. the Imperative Constructions (241); Ways of Expressing Purpose (257); Conditions in Indirect Discourse (355); Correlated Conjunctions (399); Verbs followed by Substantive Purpose Clauses (262); Perfect Tenses equivalent to Presents (209); and Constructions after Verbs of asking, demanding, teaching, and concealing (72), although many of us may prefer Gildersleeve's "This then is not the only way".

The second division of the book, called Part I, is made up of twenty-eight lessons; each lesson consists of a few grammatical references for written translation, twelve of which are to be prepared outside of class and the rest to be written during the recitation period, and finally ten sentences for oral translation.



The titles of the first six lessons show to some extent the nature of the exercises: Tenses of the Indicative; Apposition—Predicate Nouns and Adjectives—Verbs of Naming, Choosing, etc.; The Ablative Case—Means or Instrument—Agent—Specification—Accompaniment; Indirect Object—Place to Which—Place Where—Relative; Expressions of Place—Locative Case; Ablative and Genitive of Description—Vocative Case. The well-constructed sentences illustrate fully the grammatical principles of each lesson. Part I is for second year students and the vocabulary and syntax are Caesarian; Part II is for third year work and is based on Cicero's orations. In Part III, designed for seniors in preparatory schools, there are twenty-four lessons much like those of Parts I and II, except that paragraphs of connected prose are introduced; the last sixteen lessons are entirely devoted to connected discourse. In all three Parts the grammatical references at the beginning of each lesson are to the sections of Elements of Syntax, but at the end of each part the corresponding references to Gildersleeve and Lodge, Allen and Greenough, Bennett, and Harkness are supplied. An English-Latin Vocabulary closes the book.

This manual is both condensed and complete; the high-school graduate who has mastered it from cover to cover will find few compeers in the freshman class of any of our colleges.

SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY.

HAROLD L. CLEASBY.

### THE JULIAN STAR

When Halley's Comet was still several leagues away in the depths of the firmament, I had rather an amusing adventure in anticipation of its coming, the rehearsal of which may be both interesting and instructive to my fellows in the Classics.

I had been invited to attend an 'at home' by the Latin instructor in our local High School and to address the class in whose honor the occasion had been planned. Happening to note that the date assigned was the eve of the March Ides, the suggestion readily came to my mind to take advantage of the coincidence and discuss the assassination of Caesar. His deification finally became my appointed theme, with the *Iulium sidus* (Hor. Carm. 1,12.47) as the nucleus of my address. Only an hour or so previous to my coming before the assembled company, I was overjoyed to stumble upon what was to me a most astounding discovery. Armed with it, I expected to take my audience by storm.

In Duruy's History of Rome, Volume 3, Section 2, p. 559, foot-note 2, may be found this comment upon the 'hairy star' that played such an important part in the apotheosis of Caesar: "*The comet which appeared at that time was Halley's*". Even that early, although it was March of 1904, public interest was becoming alert over the expected reappearance of the great comet in 1910, so that the above statement was, to say the least, decidedly attractive. The time to

give my address was almost upon me, and I had not the slightest hesitation in accepting the dictum of Professor Mahaffy, who, as the English editor of Duruy's History, I knew was responsible for the note. My peroration was a magnificent effort, something to this effect: "And so, if we are spared to live until 1910, we shall have the pleasure of looking again upon the blazing emblem that is the soul of our great Julius, metamorphosed to the realm where it surely belongs, a seat above the greatest of Rome's gods".

It was not until almost a year after those March Ides of 1904 that I found, to my horror, that, without the leadership of M. Jules Verne, I had been veritably 'Off on a Comet'. In February of 1905, I again took up the theme in a more elaborate vein, recasting it to present before the Faculty Colloquium of the University of Oregon. Somehow, a doubt had crept into my conscience about that brilliant finale of my former address—perhaps because, in all the popular accounts of the several appearances of the Comet and of the historic events with which it was connected, no mention had elsewhere been made of so singular an event as the assassination of Caesar. I therefore began a systematic study from an astronomical standpoint and was shocked to learn how far astray I had been unwittingly led. Unlike Galileo, I am only too anxious to publish my recantation, in the hope that others may avoid digging the same pit for themselves and pulling their followers therein after them. A glance at the table of its reappearances, or, if that is not available, a simple mathematical process, will quickly prove the futility of identifying Halley's Comet with the 'Iulium sidus', for the nearest appearance to the date in question was probably in 11 B. C.—thirty-three years after the assassination and the celebration of Octavian's games, when the comet is distinctly said to have appeared.

This curious but unfortunate error should be given publicity, for the popularity and widely accepted erudition of the editor of Duruy's history are quite apt to disseminate a very gross misconception, to which my own experience bears witness.

UNIVERSITY OF OREGON.

FREDERIC STANLEY DUNN.

At the recent Thanksgiving entertainment in The Adirondack Florida School at Rainbow Lake, New York, the Electra of Euripides was presented in an abridged form by the older boys of the school. The excellent translation by Gilbert Murray was used. An introduction was given by Dr. Franklin Carter, Ex-President of Williams College, who explained briefly the style and presentation of Greek plays and the story of Electra. The attempt to interest an audience in a secondary school in a Greek play proved successful in this instance and should encourage other schools to try similar plays for at least a part of their entertainment program.

L. H. SOMERS, Head Master.

## The CLASSICAL WEEKLY

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is published by the Classical Association of the Atlantic States. It is issued weekly, on Saturdays, from October to May inclusive, except in weeks in which there is a legal or school holiday, at Teachers College, 525 West 120th Street, New York City.

The dates of issue of Volume III will be as follows: in 1909, October 2, 9, 16, 23, 30; November 13, 20; December 4, 11, 18; in 1910, January 8, 15, 22, 29; February 5, 12, 19, 26; March 5, 12, 19, 26; April 2, 9, 16, 23, 30; May 7, 14, 21, 28.

All persons within the territory of the Association who are interested in the literature, the life and the art of ancient Greece and ancient Rome, whether actually engaged in teaching the Classics or not, are eligible to membership in the Association. Application for membership may be made to the Secretary-Treasurer, Charles Knapp, Barnard College, New York. The annual dues (which cover also the subscription to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY), are two dollars. Within the territory covered by the Association (New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, District of Columbia, Virginia) subscription is possible to individuals only through membership. To institutions in this territory the subscription price is one dollar per year.

To persons and institutions outside the territory of the Association the subscription price of THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is one dollar per year.

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is conducted by the following board of editors:

### Editor-in-Chief

GONZALEZ LODGE, Teachers College, Columbia University

### Associate Editors

CHARLES KNAPP, Barnard College, Columbia University

ERNST RIESS, Boys' High School, Brooklyn

HARRY L. WILSON, Johns Hopkins University

### Business Manager

CHARLES KNAPP, Barnard College, New York City

Communications, articles, reviews, queries, etc., should be sent to the editor-in-chief. Inquiries concerning subscriptions and advertising, back numbers or extra numbers, notices of change of address, etc., should be sent to the business manager.

Printed by Princeton University Press, Princeton, N. J.

## TOWLE AND JENKS'S CAESAR'S GALLIC WAR

Text in clearer print than any other edition.  
Notes give exactly the help that pupils need.  
Grammatical Appendix contains all the grammar needed for reading Caesar.  
Vocabulary is made for pupils of ordinary capacity.

FOUR BOOKS \$1.00 SIX BOOKS \$1.25

D. C. HEATH & CO., PUBLISHERS

BOSTON NEW YORK CHICAGO

## LEND INTEREST AND VIVIDNESS

### To the Teaching of the Classics

Experience of many teachers has shown that original specimens from the times of which they are reading, or illustrative of the narrative, are useful adjuncts in the class-room. Coins are the readiest to understand, easiest and safest to handle, cheapest to acquire. I propose groups to illustrate Caesar, Cicero, Vergil, Livy, Tacitus. Here is a sample.

CAESAR. Price five dollars. (Postage 15c. extra)

A coin made by the Gauls in Caesar's time, and four Roman Silver coins, viz. one with the name of L. Titurius Sabinus, one of Decimus Brutus, and two struck by Caesar himself and referring to the Gallic Wars. Five in all, genuine and fully described. Write to

G. N. OLCOTT,

438 West 116th St.,

New York

## TWO NOTEWORTHY CLASSICAL SERIES

### MORRIS & MORGAN'S LATIN SERIES FOR SCHOOLS AND COLLEGES

Edited under the supervision of EDWARD P. MORRIS, A.M., Professor of Latin Language and Literature, Yale University, and MORRIS H. MORGAN, Ph.D., Professor of Classical Philology, Harvard University. 13 VOLUMES.

### A GREEK SERIES FOR COLLEGES AND SCHOOLS

Edited under the supervision of HERBERT WEIR SMYTH, Ph.D., Eliot Professor of Greek Literature, Harvard University. 16 VOLUMES.

Descriptive Matter Sent on Application

## AMERICAN BOOK COMPANY

NEW YORK CINCINNATI CHICAGO BOSTON

## ALLEN AND GREENOUGH'S FOUR BOOK CAESAR

\$1.00

The standard text for schools that read only four books of "Caesar."

VASSAR COLLEGE. "Allen and Greenough's Caesar is a splendid, scholarly edition, in fact ideal". J. L. Moore, Professor of Latin.

## ALLEN AND GREENOUGH'S SIX ORATIONS OF CICERO

\$1.00

An edition for those who prefer marked quantities and require six orations.

GIRLS' HIGH SCHOOL, Boston, Mass. "As nearly as possible a perfect text". Samuel Thurber, Master.

## GINN AND COMPANY: PUBLISHERS

70 Fifth Avenue : : New York City

## ABBOTT'S SHORT HISTORY OF ROME

An exceedingly interesting narrative, coupled with historical accuracy and balance in the treatment of periods, makes it a book most desirable for an elementary course in the subject.

A large number of Maps and Illustrations.

PROF. FRANK FROST ABBOTT

Professor of Classics, Princeton University

A Short History of Rome - - - - - \$1.00  
Handbook for Study - - - - - .25

## SCOTT, FORESMAN AND COMPANY

EDUCATIONAL PUBLISHERS

CHICAGO

ILLINOIS

## CAESAR: THE GALLIC WAR

By A. L. HODGES, Instructor in Latin in Wadleigh High School, New York. 12mo. Cloth. Illustrated. xiii + 522 pages. \$1.25 net.

The fourth book in the Macmillan Latin Series edited by Dr. J. C. Kirtland. It includes the seven books of the Commentaries, a comprehensive introduction, helpful notes, and a complete vocabulary.

## THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

64-66 FIFTH AVENUE, NEW YORK  
BOSTON CHICAGO ATLANTA SAN FRANCISCO

## The Students' Series of Latin Classics

59 Books Out and Under Way

LIST SENT ON APPLICATION

BENJ. H. SANBORN & CO.

156 Fifth Ave.,

New York